

REMARKS/ARGUMENTS

Claim 6 has been amended in accordance with the Examiner's suggestion. Accordingly, the rejection of claim 6 under 35 USC 112, second paragraph, has been overcome.

Independent claim 1 as well as dependent claim 2-13 are patentable over the combination of Pall '309 in view of Black, Jr. et al. for many reasons. For example independent claim 1 defines a method of making a filter which comprises inserting a narrow edge at the end portion of a core into a liquid bonding material, including dividing the liquid bonding material and directing the liquid bonding material away from the bonding area between the end cap and the end portion of the filter.

Nothing in Pall '309 discloses or suggests the method claimed in independent claim 1. For example, Pall '309 fails to teach "inserting a narrow edge." The raised portions 9 of the castellations have wide, flat and surfaces, as shown in Figures 1-4, not narrow edges. Further, Pall '309 fails to teach "dividing and directing liquid bonding material away from the bonding area between the end cap and the end portion of the filter." The wide, flat end surfaces of Pall '309 extend perpendicular to the axis of the core and are not oriented to direct the liquified bonding material of the end cap away from the bonding area. Consequently inserting the raised portions 9 of Pall '309 into a liquified end cap will not direct liquified material away from the bonding area between the end cap and the end portion of the filter, as noted in the Office Action.

Black, Jr. et al. also fails to teach "inserting a narrow edge." The projections 56 of the retainer portions 32 of Black, Jr. et al. also have wide flat end surfaces, and they are even larger than the end surface of the raised portions of Pall '309. According to Black, Jr. et al., the volume of the surface area of the mating surfaces of the end cap and the core is "critical", and an object of the invention is to provide mating surfaces which have a "large surface area." (See Col. 3, lines 4-10) Black, Jr. et al. expressly teaches that the wide flat end surface of the projection 56 of the retainer portions 32 must be large to "add surface area to the inner cage retainer portion 32 thereby aiding in attachment to the end assembly 12." (See Col. 5,

lines 25-27) Black, Jr. et al. thus teaches directly away from “inserting a narrow edge,” as set forth in independent claim 1.

Further, Black, Jr. et al. fails to teach “dividing and directing liquid bonding material away from the bonding area between the end cap and the end portion of the filter.” Even though Black, Jr. et al. discloses that the retainer portion may be reversed, the wide flat end surfaces of the reversed retainer portions will not direct liquid bonding material away from the bonding area of the filter for the same reasons that the raised portions of Pall ‘309 will not direct liquid bonding material away from the bonding area. The wide, flat surfaces of the retainer portions of Black, Jr. et al. extend perpendicular to the axis of the inner retainer and are not oriented to direct the liquified bonding material away from the bonding area of the filter upon insertion.

Because neither Pall ‘309 nor Black, Jr. et al. teach a method of making a filter which includes (1) inserting a narrow edge or (2) dividing and directing liquid bonding material away from the bonding area of the filter, the combination of Pall ‘309 and Black, Jr. et al. fails to render unpatentable independent claim 1, as well as dependent claims 2-13.

New independent claim 14 is dependent claim 10 rewritten in independent form. Dependent claim 10 was indicated as being allowable. New independent claim 19 includes a patentable limitation similar to that suggested by the examiner on page 5 of the Office Action. Consequently, it is respectfully contended that both independent claims 14 and 19, as well as dependent claims 15-18 and 20-25, are also patentable.

Respectfully submitted,



John M. Belz, Reg. No. 30,359
LEYDIG, VOIT & MAYER
700 Thirteenth Street, N.W., Suite 300
Washington, DC 20005-3960
(202) 737-6770 (telephone)
(202) 737-6776 (facsimile)

Date: 26 Aug 2005
JMB/cld